

Task Force to Study Sexism in The Episcopal Church and Develop Anti-Sexism Training
7pm-9pm Tuesday, March 19th, 2019
Hyatt Regency O'Hare, Chicago

Attending:

Laura Russell, chair
J. Scott Mayer, vice-chair
Helen Svoboda-Barber, secretary
Brooks Cato
John Harris
Spencer Hatcher
Michael Hunn
Tracy Johnson Russell
Katherine Karr-Cornejo
Alexandra (Sasha) Killewald
Yein Kim
Katie Sherrod

Excused: Mark Beckwith
Sophia Kitch-Peck
Jennifer Reddall

Absent:

Opening Prayer: Bp Scott Mayer

Introductions

Review of Resolutions

Both resolutions sunset at the next General Convention

One thing we need to work on is deciding if we should ask to extend them

What other resolutions might we want to put forward to continue this work?

Charge from C060

Research sexism in The Episcopal Church, and the role it plays in:

pay equity

status

gender-based harassment

Report to 80th General Convention

plan to provide materials/resources to combat sexism in the Church

Charge from D023

Research and develop a training program

to address systemic sexism within church & society

Goal

raise awareness of bias

eliminate sexist hiring practices within the church

identify intersectionalities of discrimination

By Dec 31, 2019

complete development of training program
submit training program to Executive Council for approval

Once approved, this training will be required for

all bishops, priests, deacons

all lay persons elected to leadership (including, not limited to:)

Executive Council

Diocesan Standing Committees, Councils, Boards of Trustees
similar bodies of other names

Diocesan search committees for bishop elections

Training encouraged for

all congregational search committees

Task force shall report to Executive Council yearly

and to the 80th General Convention

on the status of the training implementation

recommendations for continued development and improvement

We would like to ask for an extension on creating this training from Executive Council

Perhaps we could pilot this in a few dioceses that are on board, then to all

Do thoughtful work

Try it

Get feedback at all levels: trainers, trainees, etc etc

Tweak it to improve before rolled out for all

Research in Blue Book report, due December 2020

Create training with modules for different people, different levels

1. Sexism 101

2. Hiring best practices

3. Anti-bias training

4. Use a thing that already exists, and do teaching about it

a. State of the Church

b. Called to Serve

etc

What would the product look like?

Video vignettes along with group in-person discussion questions

like Anglican Church of Canada's safe church training

like the Iona Collaborative's video at home + discussion group

Questions could be adapted to context, group

Single vignettes could be used at beginnings of meeting

OR multiple vignettes could be put together for a longer training

Also create fun reinforcement for after training
Games to play
Word puzzles and games
Memes to share

Who will be monitoring this training long-term? This will be important
Can we build in a feedback loop
Would like training to be regularly updated based on feedback

Anchor in the Baptismal Covenant

Look at the bible stories that are used to subjugate women
reinforcing patriarchal norms, etc
research how these stories have developed sexism in the church
AND hold up the stories that hold up women
(syrophenician woman, midwives, flow of blood, Easter, etc)
Module name: "The Persisterhood"

After 2021: How do we address institutional sexism of policies & structures?
ie we structure meeting times to favor men
ie Standing Committee meetings at noon on Wednesdays

If we want to have sustained change,
what matters is a sustained community of learning & accountability
a one-off event probably will not be effective

Could we call it something besides "training"?
formation? education?

Remember it's not just man vs woman.
Gender issues and internalized sexism are real, too
Poor reactions to non binary people
Gender norms are really restrictive to everyone, not just women and lgbtq
Sexism perpetuates gender norms. We want to break that down

Should higher modules of this training include:
address canons in diocese to check for and correct male language
consider our liturgy and our male-centric language of God
the bedrock on which all of this sits is patriarchy
and can Christianity stand without patriarchy?
think about the Doctrine of Discovery materials. Like that.

Write a Blue Book Report

with resources for opening conversations and learning modules
we can't fix sexism in this triennium

Other task forces/people/groups we should work with

Task Force to Develop Model Sexual Harassment Policies & Safe Church Training
(they would like to meet with us while we're here)

Executive Council Racial Reconciliation Committee

have been working on a training on an -ism since the late 1980s
they are happy to share what they have learned

Paula Nesbitt, about her "Called to Serve" report and other gender data she has

The yearly State of the Church report has some of the statistics already

What is the most efficient way to do this work without recreating the wheel?

Matthew Price Church Pension Group will speak with us on Thursday

He will propose to Executive Council that Church Pension Group produce data about:

looking at gender, hiring, salary, years ordained, age, parish size
years of credited service, salary vs experience

People try to explain away the data, but we don't have actual info about why it happens

Can we get the raw data from Church Pension Group?

Or can we ask them to run questions with their data sets?

Methodist Church gender pay gap is much smaller

their bishops decide where clergy go

this points to search committee (and/or candidate) bias in The Episcopal Church

Salary negotiations

not that women don't negotiate, it's that they are not as successful
cultural differences of expectation of men and women

Look at diocese who have tried pay gap work change (Georgia, etc)

Look at longitudinal data to see if changes have made a difference

Encourage or mandate what has been proven to work

Prov IV and VII

ordain disproportionate number of men

have more of the largest parishes

Will there be resistance to this training?

A sense that bishops will support. Don't think there's going to be resistance

Lay people resistance

I have to take another day off, or lose a Saturday

I don't need it

If it's happening at a meeting they're already at, it lowers resistance
vignettes and discussion

but there are also really complicated guys who would be less likely
to take on leadership if vignettes at each meeting

fragility is part of the resistance.

need to talk about this with the learners

Since #metoo, men flabbergasted by what has happened to women in the church
is there some way we can test how it “feels” to be in the system now and after training?
policy can say one thing, and we can totally do another
General Convention may need to call for a longitudinal study

It’s not too much to expect that every person is valued for being a human being, a Child of God,
in the church. No matter gender, clothing, binary/nonbinary etc etc

This expectation feels so far away

This expectation feels so nice

Sub-committees

Culture of Sexual Violence Harassment, etc

Tracy

Yen

Data Collection, Equity, House of Bishops

Sasha

Helen

History

Mark

Yein

Theology etc

Brooks

Tracy

Katie

Sofia

Katherine

Training

Katherine

Sophia

Spencer

Michael

Training works on the overall architecture

other groups then populate the structure

Curriculum Mapping first, all together

then go out and create the modules

This meeting

Map curriculum

After this meeting:

Training sub-committee

look more into how to train
Other committees
content of modules for their training

Core of modules:

What is Sexism?

Patriarchal construct

Our Baptismal Covenant calls us to resist this patriarchy

Where does it happen?

Everywhere, including in the church

Here's an example (or several)

Who does it affect?

Women and men and all of us

when a man cuts himself off from half of humanity, there is impoverishment

many perpetrators of sexism: their impact isn't their intent

unpacking this is painful

when we hear the truth, get past the pain, then true community happens

What does the bible say about this?

What can we do about it?

Questions for Conversation

What is the audience for the different modules?

intra-Vestry dynamics would be different than seminarians etc

categories of incidences?

categories of Yuck

structural categories

could have same vignette (a layperson commenting on a clergy person's looks)

different questions for different groups (bystander, vestry, clergy, etc etc)

What do we do about training for the diocese that are completely culturally different from those of us around the table?

Europe

Prov IX: different languages, different culture

ASK Prov IX for their vignettes and questions

Don't want to do this as Cultural Imperialism being shoved down their throats

Achievable goals can go across cultures

equal pay, more women in leadership

How do we network with folks?

How will international bishops feel about this?

Latinx ministry network (Katherine knows about). Anthony Guillen

Design it so all it takes is one interested person in a diocese can drive this

Katherine happy to work on Spanish language stuff

Build a website with testimonials “I thought it would be hard, but we did it, and it was worth it.”

Decisions

We would like to ask Executive Council for a 6-month extension on creating this training

Next Meeting: Tomorrow morning, March 20th, 2019. 8:30 Morning Prayer, Meeting at 9am

Task Force to Study Sexism in The Episcopal Church and Develop Anti-Sexism Training
9am Wednesday March 20, 2019
Hyatt Regency O'Hare, Chicago

Attending:

Laura Russell, chair
J. Scott Mayer, vice-chair
Helen Svoboda-Barber, secretary
Mark Beckwith
Brooks Cato
John Harris
Spencer Hatcher
Michael Hunn
Tracy Johnson Russell
Katherine Karr-Cornejo
Alexandra Killewald
Yein Kim
Katie Sherrod

Excused:

Sophia Kitch-Peck
Jennifer Reddall

Absent:

Resolution C060

Research sexism's impact in TEC re: pay equity, status, gender-based harassment

1. What already exists, that we can report?

Committee on the Status of Women archives

Diocese pay/role gaps: Maryland, California, Georgia, Newark

2. What data do we need to compile?

Transition Ministry Conference has been looking 2x per year
met often with Matthew Price to look at data

Frank Logue might be a good contact here

Meghan Froehlich working with Transition Officers re: bias

Office of Pastoral Development consultants

Todd Ousley would hold this history, even before his time
not sure this office keeps records of all nominees

Template given to dioceses in search re: inclusivity

Diocese affirms that they did x,y,z for inclusivity

3. What data do we actually need to gather?

both clergy and lay staff

listing all parishes and their clergy salaries

which diocese still do this?

could we compare those that do/don't for pay gaps difference?

look at clergy compensated at minimum, and those above
look at lifetime pay for average women vs average man
experience of women in the church
 how bad is it, and what is the flavor
 what is institutional? what is harassment?
 hear from women, this is what it feels like (normal and intense)
 how often does this happen in your life?
 Work with Gender Parity Ad Hoc (Gia Hays-Martin, etc)
 small group of GenX women meeting since 2016
 around these issues
General Convention Office has a research department
 We could ask them some questions
Look at who is encouraged, runs and is elected to
 vestry, standing committee, commission on ministry
 those making decisions

Task Force for Women, Truth and Reconciliation is sending out a very helpful survey
 15 kinds of church involvement
 familiarity with policies
 know where to report an incident
 any educational programs in The Episcopal Church
 received unwanted attention: list
 aware of anyone else who has had harassment
 nuances
 what decade these happened in
 how did you respond
 make a formal complaint or not, what was church's response
 how did this affect you

We'd love to talk to folks who designed this
 Shannon MacVean-Brown, Diocese of Indianapolis priest
 Carolyn Woodall, Diocese of California deacon

Motivating folks whose heart in the right place, allies
 Increase their awareness

There is a "service burden" for clergy
 expecting women, PoC to do all the hard work
 tokenism
 asked to be on all committees, etc

Case study approach: What is going on in 3-4 diocese, draw out info
 tokenism
 women laity
 pay gap work

If we collect data from 4 diocese
then have them do the training we've created
then do a post survey with these diocese

What would case studies look like?

deep dive qualitatively
dig historical information out
get lessons from this
here are 3 problems, and how we might move forward

New Resolution for 80th General Convention: How to do this research well
parameters of research
who has the skills to do this
here's how much it would cost
here's how it will be reported
here is how to pastorally care for those speaking, listening

Maybe we could build a website that would link to what is out there.
Then Standing Committees, Transition Officers, etc could find what's there
What should it include?
ie Georgia's template and results
Contact person to learn more about x
Not specific data that could be identified to an individual

Our possible work for these three years

There is not Anti-sexism training happening yet
Let's talk to groups doing research in this area to make better training
Let's compile the research that is going on and put it in one place (website?)

We could create an executive summary, what's being done, what needs to be done
"Is Sexism Real?" yes, and here is

Something that isn't being done yet is getting to institutional factors
Compile diocesan policies
pay scale
parental leave

WHY DATA?

There are a number of institutional pieces that people have just never thought of
pay scales reduce gender pay gap

first round searches scrubbed for gender, race, etc improve women's chances

WHY STORIES?

Stories are eye opening

Can change "good people's" hearts

Does enough good come out of this?

it costs/re-opens wounds to tell stories. Is the change worth the cost?

again asking unremunerated, uncompensated emotional labor on the part of all

3 buckets of our work together

1. Categories to examine

women in seminary, women clergy, traditional/ alternate training

lay people, bishops

2. What processes we use

getting stories

data

researching the research

3. Outcome

training

systemic change

We will present a training to Executive Council with a plan in December 2019 (or June 2020)

A. Here is the framework

Many modules (20-40 total) of 15-30 minutes each

First session for all groups will be 60-90 minutes, made of several modules

To be certified, you must take these x basic modules

To keep certification current, you must engage 2 modules per year

Different groups will have different suggested paths

Search Committee

Commission on Ministry

Vestry

Ready to go Deeper

etc

B. Here are the diocese we would like to use as case studies

C. Here are the first few of our many modules

D. We will work with case study diocese

edit and update based on their feedback

E. Create more modules between Dec/June and Blue Book report

We can create some vignette story boards and questions for Executive Council

in December 2019 or June 2020

tell them we're still involved with research and will be creating more training

What is the recourse for a clergy person offended by a lay person?

There is no clear path, but it is a reality

We need to have vignettes about this to help groups grapple with this

Create a slide that each diocese should fill in

If this brings up pastoral concerns, contact _____

If this brings up Title IV concerns, contact _____

Curriculum Map: A series of questions which we use to organize/structure our work

Why do we do this training?

What is Sexism?

Where does it happen?

Who does it affect?

What can we do about it?

MAP

one dot . = Foundational training

two dots .. = Intermediate training

three dots ... = Advanced training

Why do we do this training?

History

.basic

..mid

...intense

Patriarchy

.basic: gendered structures in which we live

..mid

...intense

Theology

.basic

..mid

...intense

.Terminology

.How this in the church is different from corporate settings

.To live into who God has called the church to be

..Language

..Give people tools to change their own congregation

..It is everyone's responsibility. Not just women. Not just institution.

..We want it to feel differently when people walk into our building

..Evangelism: Christianity that is not full of Patriarchal Crap

..Explicit about power/expertise

..Vulnerability

- (.How to use this curriculum with a group of all men)
- (.How to use this curriculum with a group of all women)

What Is Sexism?

- .Sexism 101
 - definition, examples
 - spectrum of behavior and belief (egregious vs cringe worthy vs unnoticed)
 - systemic/institutional
 - gender bias vs sexism
- .Glossary/terminology
- ..Gendered language (and also high level ...)
- .Gender: nonbinary, nonconforming, fluid genders
(Intersectionality)
- .Images of God
 - .basic
 - ..mid
 - ...intense
- ..How our liturgical life does/does not uphold sexism
(Don't expect harmed group/individual to be your teacher)
- .Power
 - .basic
 - ..mid
 - ...intense

Where does it happen?

- .research on pay gaps, hiring, elections, etc
- .In meetings, committees, worship
- .Hiring, invitation to lay leadership
 - 101 best practices
 - 201 implicit bias
- .Intent does not equal impact.
- .structures (are not God-given reality)
 - .basic
 - ..mid
 - ...intense (putting women in structure built for men doesn't fix problem)
- .Church as part of broader context, yet distinctive
- .Scripture
 - .basic
 - ..mid
 - ...intense
- Modes: e-mail, in person, body language
 - .basic
 - ..mid
 - ...intense

- .Language
- ..Reproductive choices, family leave
- ..Going through the ordination process
- ..Titles and terms of respect, regional and cultural practices
 - ...role of Father and Mother in family are very different
- ...Generations of trauma

Who does it affect?

- .Sexism hurts everyone
- .Pay gaps, hiring, elections
- ..Toxic Masculinity/Male Fragility
- .Intersectionality
- .Youth/Children (Girls, boys, fluid gender)
 - .basic
 - ..mid
 - ...intense
- ...Lay leaders, ordination process
- .Dress codes (eg schools)
- ...Women who have attained power, men who feel little power

What can we do about this? All of these can be both 101 and 201

- .Best practices
- .Because people want to be allies, want the tools
- .The power of discomfort
- Critical reflexivity: Reflect on your actions, individually and corporately
- Confess our sin, repent, forgive, reconciliation
- Language change
- Bystander training 101, 201, 301
- Continuing Resources
 - scripture studies
 - theological studies
- Constantly thinking about it, it continues: institutionally
- Be affirming, use our privilege for good
- Listening to someone else explain what they want/need
- Mentoring women, lgbtq, not at the table into all leadership
- Be explicit about power/experience and vulnerability
- Keep hoping
- How to survive in a sexist world/culture and still value your morals
- ...Change the structure
- Radical welcome and hospitality
- (Training)
- (Case studies)
- (Give a toolbox, increase empathy, ability to communicate clearly)
- (Equip each diocese on multiple levels)

Before each engagement of this material:

The power of discomfort should be a preamble to every time anyone engages this material

Discomfort is a sign of something shifting, sign of our ability to enter in, to change

We are not pointing fingers at you, we're looking at the structure

We are looking to create a church where everyone can flourish

Fault vs Responsibility

Acknowledge: The work we are asking people to do is inherently unsafe, inherently risky work

It will be uncomfortable

It will poke you in your bruised places

This invitation is different for privileged person vs folks who hold wounds

There will be varying levels of risk and willingness to enter into that risk

When we feel safe/good, it is not the best space to learn

**We are both asking men to imagine a world where sexism is rampant
AND we are asking women to imagine a world where sexism doesn't exist**

This training creates a space where who has the power is completely turned over
as we are creating these, it will be important for us to understand this

Remember there will be training situations where there will be only one woman or lgbtq, or none. We need to give guidance for these situations so that "the one" isn't expected to share their stories or answer for all women/queer etc

Resolution for 80th General Convention: This task force would like to encourage a permanent full-time paid position in The Episcopal Church to oversee this work of Anti-sexism.

Consciousness in regards to representation in vignettes.

Think about color, age, status, cis, heterosexism throughout

We need to keep in mind that we don't want to alienate those who are already on the margins (lgbtq, poc, women) in order to not alienate those who are nervous about these topics.

We need to build in good power dynamics to all this work: sharing power, working with the energy people bring into the room. NOT "power over."

Break into groups to work on each of these Curriculum Maps

1. Why do we do this?

Katie, Spencer, Brooks, Katherine, Michael

2. The rest of it (what is sexism, where does it happen, who does it affect)

Mark, Helen, Yein, John, Sasha, Tracy

Breakout Group What is sexism, Where does it happen? who does it affect?. Convener: Helen

Sexism 101: introductory handout

- what is sexism
- How is sexism different than gender bias
- forms, context
- levels of offence
- gender stereotypes
 - discussion questions
- gender vs sex, nonbinary, etc
- intent vs impact
- glossary

Gender Roles

- toxic masculinity ideas
- church one institution within broader culture
- who gets invited

Sexism as Lived Experience

- sort of things that can happen
- reward/recognition
- minimizing/denying
- gender segregation
- different modes
- sexism through policies
 - designed for men, don't work for women
 - response to women entering arena

Ordained Careers

- vignettes
- fertility intentions
- reading resumes
- negotiations
- handout: pay gaps, elections
- clergy spouse expectations

Engaged in Gendered Socialization of children

- who we see
- dress codes
- language in liturgy

Throughout all pathways

- best practices
- what we can do
- how this plays out intersectionality

Group Why do we Do This. Convener: Spencer

- Hope: this is why we do this. Power of discomfort. Hope hurts. (Moltmann, the rocks that are tumbled smooth)
- God is beyond (understanding, humanity, etc) → Humanity is made in the image of God (male *and* female) → but we and the world are broken in sin → and God is made manifest in the person of Jesus Christ (humanity is not equivalent to maleness)
- Scripture and interpretation / hermeneutic
- Patriarchy and systems of sexism are evidence of the sin of humanity
- Flrst: liberation narrative in Hebrew Scripture. People desire a king (patriarchy) → Paul → Hope of resurrection and women's testimony
- Way of Love - Worship/Follow Jesus not scripture
- Discipleship and baptism → Baptismal Covenant → invitation to spiritual formation, to let go of sexism and patriarchy, to be liberated. Invite space for reflection, to name dissention and tensions → live into hope: go forth and witness the Good News in the world

Other considerations: build in engagement points along this system. Communication is important, to provide a model covenant and guidelines.

So an example, in the second bulleted section, an exercise could be to ask participants to talk about the earliest images of God they encountered (or the images of their childhood). Explore the gendered nature of those images, and lead into conversation about how those images have influenced assumptions about God (for example, that God is a Zeus-like bearded man in the sky: what does that mean for how you perceive power?)

Our Committee's Next Steps

1. Get clarity about total modules: tomorrow
2. Learning objectives for each module plan: by May 15th
Katherine, Spencer, Tracy, John
3. Each person then goes and writes part of it: May - July

The FIRST activity should be 1 to 1 ½ hours long
includes each type of activity (vignette, bible study, case study, activity, etc etc)

TASKS

Laura will be liaison to Matthew Price at Church Pension Group
Michael will talk to Meghan Froehlich at Transition Office
Mark will talk to Todd Ousley at Pastoral Development
Laura will talk to Paula Nesbitt with Committee on the Status of Women

Katherine will connect with Prov IX and Latinx Episcopalians
John will connect with Women, Truth and Reconciliation Task Force
Yein and Spencer will connect with Young ClergyWom^{ens} Project: Episcopal and Anglican
Laura GC79 ^{womens} group
Katherine will connect with Prov VIII ECW president
Wait to connect with: Breaking the Episcopal Stained Glass Ceiling

What Data Are We Interested In?

- Gender of bishop slates

- Gender of bishops

- What sort of gender proportional leadership is there in
 commision on ministry

 - vestries

 - standing committee

 - bishop search committees

 - ordained and lay

 - WHY are they like they are?

 - breakdowns of elected vs appointed

- Gender of senior diocesan staff

- Which diocese publish clergy salaries

 - does this make a difference in pay disparity

- Which diocese use minimums and pay charts

 - do they make a difference in pay disparity

- Gendered career path pay difference

 - why do women make different choices than men

- If women cleric is primary breadwinner, does it match man's earnings?

- Find a handful of men/women starting path the same way/time/place,

 - examine jobs/earnings

 - mid 20s (Helen Svoboda-Barber/Gar Demo)

 - lawyer, went to seminary in 40s/50s

 - etc

- What is the breakdown of province/diocese of how many women ordained

 - priest

 - deacon

- What about reproductive choices: priests who are parents, when does it happen?

- Who is at electing conventions, at every level?

UPCOMING

Before May 16th Katherine will convene the teachers' group to do their work

May 16th 12:00-1:00pm eastern Zoom meeting, full group

June Subcommittees meets by zoom

July	Full committee meets by zoom
August	Subcommittees meets by zoom
September	Full committee meets by zoom
October	Subcommittees meets by zoom
November	Full committee meets by zoom:
December	Subcommittees meets by zoom
January	Full committee meets by zoom
February	Subcommittees meets by zoom
March	Full committee meets by zoom
April 23-25	In person meeting (or sometime April 21-25)

Conveners choose meeting times

Blue Book report due beginning of December 2020. Needs to start being written in September 2020

Task Force to Study Sexism in The Episcopal Church and Develop Anti-Sexism Training
9am Thursday March 21, 2019
Hyatt Regency O'Hare, Chicago

Attending:

Laura Russell, chair
J. Scott Mayer, vice-chair
Helen Svoboda-Barber, secretary
Mark Beckwith
Brooks Cato
John Harris
Spencer Hatcher
Michael Hunn
Tracy Johnson Russell
Katherine Karr-Cornejo
Alexandra Killewald
Yein Kim
Katie Sherrod

Visitor: Matthew Price

Excused:

Sophia Kitch-Peck
Jennifer Reddall

Absent:

Discussion with Matthew Price from Church Pension Group

Church Pension Group proposing to Executive Council that their reports go down to the diocesan level, perhaps position as well in some new ways.

In the past few decades, there have been increased privacy regulations. Church Pension Group uses the federal standard: a cell must have at least 5 people to report.

QUESTION: If there isn't enough in diocese, will you report on provincial level? Please do!

What are you discovering?

Pilot work sharing information with the Diocese of Chicago
They did close some of the gender pay gap

Keep in mind: with baby boomer retirements, there will be a lot of turnover in many larger congregations.

In Chicago, with vigilance, the turnover has resulted in more women clergy in larger parishes.

Where is Church Pension Group in terms of deacons?

They only have salary data on fewer than 200, since most are unpaid
there are about 3,000 deacons in The Episcopal Church
median age of deacons is around 65
gender breakdown is about 50/50 for deacons.

 Closer gender balance than priests.

 New deacons ordained: slightly more females

 New priests ordained: 55% male, 45% female

Fairly confident they have a comprehensive list of all deacons

Dioceses used to publish salaries of every clergy person. Fewer do now. Why?

 Is it because of embarrassment about pay discrepancy as more women became clergy?

 When Matthew arrived at CPG, there was no privacy office.

 Now we have a full-time privacy officer and lots of data compliance rules

 With any non-profit, compensation is publicly available.

Do you have longitudinal data on paid positions? On one person's lifetime income?

Paula Nesbitt worked on this over a 15 year period, and found that especially in senior positions, both salary and numbers of women have changed less than you would expect and hope.

What from a policy perspective is actually effective to change the gender pay gap?

 One thing is to have a Diocesan compensation committee take the problem seriously

 Chicago did something, and it made a difference

Diocese are not the only point of leverage.

Parish search committees have a lot of power.

We don't know much about them.

A good project would be to look carefully at search committees:

 their composition, criteria, training

 and see how that relates to who gets hired

Most respondents in the Called to Serve report

 felt the diocese was neutral. Not a force against them (nor for them).

 More issues were related to what happens in parish search committees

What's the trajectory of numbers of full-time clergy: historically and in the future?

 6,000 full time clergy when Matthew began

 5,000 full time clergy today

When you index the pay over time,

the clergy compensation figure has stayed still or even shrunk in real terms.

It peaked right before the great recession and has never recovered.
We were losing 3% of our full-time clergy per year at the end of the recession.
Almost 10% in 3 years.
Now the loss has slowed to about 1%. Seems to be driven by current economic conditions.

We have had, and will continue to have, large numbers of retirement
We now have more retired clergy than active clergy
Retired clergy who serve congregations are a big chunk of people who serve part time

Part-time, bivocational, and non-stipendiary
more likely to be female, more likely to be ordained later

Every cleric that serves in any parish should be enrolled in these numbers—even if they are not compensated. Church Pension Group verifies this information in 2 ways:

- 1) Asks clergy to check the online Red Book directory to make sure it's correct
- 2) Each parish reports every cleric working in their parish on the Parochial Report

Does CPG keep track of diocesan parental leave policies?
no
recently changed short term disability for childbirth

Does CPG keep track of transgender clergy?
we don't as of now
there is a General Convention resolution referred to Transition Ministry Office
to do a survey on this

Does Church Pension Group keep track of Race and Ethnicity of clergy?
not right now
as Recorder of Ordinations, there is a proposal that they would
Diocese would report race/ethnicity (just as they do for gender, age) at ordination
For existing clergy, they could do a one-off report
each year, diocese sends list of canonically resident cleric
for one year, they would send race and ethnicity of each clergy

This is one of the things the upcoming Executive Council will discuss at next meeting

When Church Pension Group does reports, we combine data from:
recorder of ordination
pension fund
parochial report

Is it possible to track dual employee couples? We are interested in knowing whether is it the cleric that drives the movement or if the cleric is the trailing spouse.

Church Pension Group had a great focus group in clergy career patterns

looked at interim, part-time

Family concerns had influenced many people's job moves

Relocation because of spouse

had been on the traditional track, then moved, fell off that track

Looked at household income AND individual clergy income

household income of women clergy who were married to male clergy = higher

household income male clergy married to female non-clergy = lower

spousal salary was higher for non-clergy spouse and drove decisions

having to care for elderly parents is impacting the lives of our clergy and employment choices

Can certainly look at children as a data point

Look at age/compensation at ordination

under 35 starting at same compensation

over time that gap grows

What are the critical moments where that gap grows?

If women take time out of the workforce, it's almost impossible to catch up

This is a major data point of inequality

Is there a difference between men and women taking time away?

We don't know.

Between ordination and any given date (55 or 60)

the proportion of time men have as credited service is higher than women have

we don't know if this is actual unemployment, or just working outside of the church

Important Data We Know:

married male clergy earn more than single male clergy

single male clergy earn more than single female clergy

single female clergy earn more than married female clergy

Does this pay gap hold up for bishops, too?

haven't been able to look because of privacy rules

This is the first year we could do this, since we now have more than 5 diocesan bishops

Matthew could reach out to Consortium of Endowed Parishes to see if they're tracking gender at all

Could Church Pension Group show lifetime earnings by gender?

not just HAC

This is complicated, but Matthew Price will look into this

Average Sunday Attendance and Parish Budget: how do these relate to gender?

When are we going to see the dial move so that women are moving into the biggest parishes with the highest compensation?

Matthew thinks it would be interesting to look at parish budget as the breakdown

How can we best train search committees (and transition officers) to crack that nut?

implicit selection bias would be an excellent thing to look at

Is there anything we're not talking about gender/pay equity/gender roles?

We need to be attentive to region

much higher proportion of our larger congregation in Province IV and VII

historically, Province IV and VII have a larger proportion of male clergy

significant gap in age of priest's ordination - men significantly younger

more young clergy men especially in Province IV and VII

Look at why do we have this age + gender gap at ordination? What is driving that?

Why are we not bringing more young women into the ordination process?

Clergy Couples

dream that they would take turns being leading spouse/ the one with the Big Job

This doesn't actually happen

The currently trailing spouse has a difficult time getting a "good job" next

Those who already have "good jobs" can more easily get better jobs

Interesting to look at clergy couple pay

whose job takes priority in couples' decision-making process

(clergy couples may be one thing, one clergy spouse might be different)

There are folks at Virginia Seminary that are interested in this

Use to be the norm that the cleric had full family health insurance, provided stability

now anecdotally, some clergy don't have full family health insurance

Is there enough info to compare

opposite sex clergy couples

2 men clergy couples

2 women clergy couples

Yes, Matthew thinks they could do that.

In the secular workforce, overall dropping of salaries when women enter workforce.

Teachers and Social Workers are classic cases of this.
Is this true in The Episcopal Church?
True with the Episcopacy?
Do average compensation rates drop?

Paula Nesbitt wrote the book "Feminization of Clergy".
She's long predicted this drop in pay.

With churches, there is such a drop.
But with the drop in overall ASA during the same time, it's more complicated.

It would be worth the committee having a conversation with Paula Nesbitt

Is there a list of variables Church Pension Group has access to?
Our Task Force would like to understand what data is in your universe
You can see many of the items from these reports:
 Parochial report
 State of the Clergy
 Church Compensation Report
We also have
 marital status
 average Sunday attendance

A couple of resolutions are out there asking Church Pension Fund to examine issues around parenting. They'll be going out into the church to do this.

Task Force to Study Sexism in The Episcopal Church and Develop Anti-Sexism Training
11:00 Thursday March 21, 2019. Final wrap-up for this gathering
Hyatt Regency O'Hare, Chicago

Attending:

Laura Russell, chair
J. Scott Mayer, vice-chair
Helen Svoboda-Barber, secretary
Mark Beckwith
Brooks Cato
John Harris
Spencer Hatcher
Michael Hunn
Tracy Johnson Russell
Katherine Karr-Cornejo
Alexandra Killewald
Yein Kim
Katie Sherrod

Excused:

Sophia Kitch-Peck
Jennifer Reddall

Hyatt Regency O'Hare, Chicago

Types of modules/things to include

Choose your own adventure
Is it Mansplaining

Modules to create

The Unrepentant person, sexist who won't change
"Oh, I realize I did this sexist thing 10 years ago. What do I do?"
"Oh, that's just Henry. You'll get used to him."
Bystander training 101, 201, 301
Becoming an ally
Who do you mentor?
Fault vs responsibility

WHAT CAN WE DO ABOUT THIS Page, broken into responsible parties

A resource page

Bible studies that already exist
Theology studies
reading list
Best Practices page
Information on the value of discomfort as we learn. "Hope hurts"

Resources for confession and repentance

Trainees

Come up with resources themselves, populate the website with their resources
Reflect, as a group, how your specific leadership group will enact best practices
Every time: Best practice review, discomfort review
Be knowledgeable, be curious
Critical reflexivity (reflect on your actions, individually and corporately)
Be aware of language: masculine, binary
Confession and repentance
Think about bystander training for your group and parish
Hope, and change your structures
Becoming an ally, who do you mentor?
Reflect on Fault vs Responsibility
Radical welcome and hospitality
Formation & Discipleship

Task Force

Best Practices page on website
Fill-in the blank form "I hold _____ position in ____ group,
and individually I will _____ and as a group we will _____"
Teach about the power of discomfort in the leader's guide. Write the 1 ppg to repeat
Language: carefully introduce
Communications toolbox
Write really good case studies
Make bystander modules
Teach and model hope and change our structure
Equipping diocese, congregations and groups
Formation & Discipleship

Church

Be knowledgeable, be curious
Language: not male-centric, not binary
Liturgical language change
Full Time Institutional position
Hope, and change our structure
Becoming an ally, who do you mentor?
Continuing Resources - resolutions and more
Equipping Diocese
Formation & Discipleship

Thank you to all. See you by Zoom in mid-May.

